



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
-----------------	-------------	----------------------	---------------------	------------------

10/586,098

03/20/2007

Mikhail Laksin

S9025.0219

1736

32172 7590 09/03/2009  
DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP  
1633 Broadway  
NEW YORK, NY 10019

EXAMINER

SHAH, MANISH S

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

2853

MAIL DATE

DELIVERY MODE

09/03/2009

PAPER

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

<b>Office Action Summary</b>	<b>Application No.</b> 10/586,098	<b>Applicant(s)</b> LAKSIN ET AL.	
	<b>Examiner</b> Manish S. Shah	<b>Art Unit</b> 2853	

**-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --**

**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

**Status**

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 01 July 2009.
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**.                      2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

**Disposition of Claims**

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-20 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-20 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

**Application Papers**

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

**Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119**

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All    b) ☐ Some \*    c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

**Attachment(s)**

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)                     | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)           |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____                                      |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)          | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____  | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____                          |

## DETAILED ACTION

### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103***

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

1. Claims 1-20 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Ylitalo et al. (# US 2003/0083396) in view of Subbraraman et al. (# US 5710195).

Ylitalo et al. discloses:

- A printing ink comprising: (i) polymerizable material ([0085]); (ii) an energy curable monomer, oligomer, or mixture thereof ([0090]-[0093]); and (iii) a vehicle ([0079]-[0081]).
- The energy curable monomer, oligomer, or mixture thereof, is an ethylenically unsaturated monomer, oligomer, or mixture thereof ([0091]-[0093]), wherein the energy curable monomer, oligomer, or mixture thereof, is in an amount of about 1% to 50% by weight of the printing ink ([0093]).
- The vehicle comprises water, ethanol, n-propanol, iso-propanol, n-butanol, sec-butanol, tert-butanol, iso-butanol, n-pentanol, or ethyl acetate ([0081]).

- The ink further comprising a photoinitiator, wherein the photoinitiator is in an amount between about 0.1% and about 20% (5 to 15%) by weight of the printing ink ([0094]-[0099]).
- The photoinitiator is selected from the group consisting of benzophenone ([0095]).
- A method of printing comprising: (i) printing a substrate with the printing ink (ii) drying the printed ink; and (iii) exposing the printed ink to an actinic radiation, wherein actinic radiation is IR light or electron beam ([0109]-[0113]).
- The steps (ii) and (iii) are performed sequentially or steps (ii) and (iii) are performed simultaneously ([0112]).

Ylitalo et al. differ from the claim of the present invention is that the ink comprising the solvent-soluble resin, which is selected from nitrocellulose, acrylate, methacrylate, polyester, polyamide, copolymer of styrene and maleic anhydride, polyurethane and epoxy. The solvent-soluble resin is in a range between about 0.1% to about 40% by weight of the printing ink.

Subbaraman et al. teaches that to get printed image with high opacity, with high contrast and good adhesion, ink composition comprises the solvent-soluble resin (see Abstract), wherein resin is selected from styrene resin, and acrylate type resin (see Abstract; column: 3, line: 55-67; column: 4, line: 1-20; see Examples), and nitrocellulose (see Examples; column: 5, line: 5-15). They also teaches that the solvent-soluble resin is in a range between about 0.1% to about 40% by weight of the printing ink (column: 3, line: 55-65; see Examples).

Art Unit: 2853

It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention to modify the ink composition of Ylitalo et al. by the aforementioned teaching of Subbaraman et al. in order to have a printed image with high opacity, with high contrast and good adhesion.

### ***Response to Arguments***

2. Applicant's arguments filed 07/1/2009 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. Applicant argued that there is no teaching or suggestion in this reference of the presence of an energy curable monomer, oligomer or mixture, which is not persuasive, the primary reference Ylitalo clearly discloses in paragraph [0093] that the ink composition comprises polymerizable and/or crosslinkable multifunctional monomer and oligomers.

3. Applicant argued that there must be some reason to extract some teaching from secondary reference and incorporate it into the primary reference, the office action does not propose such reason, which is not persuasive. The secondary reference Subbaraman et al. clearly teaches in abstract that "The quantities of resin are chosen according to the desired viscosity, adhesion strength." and which gives image with high opacity with high contrast and good adhesion. This proper reason to incorporate the solvent soluble resin. Therefore combination of the references are still reads on the present claimed invention.

***Conclusion***

4. **THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL.** Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Manish S. Shah whose telephone number is (571) 272-2152. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00am-4:30pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Stephen D. Meier can be reached on (571) 272-2149. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Art Unit: 2853

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Manish S. Shah/  
Primary Examiner  
Art Unit 2853

/MSS/